

## Executive Summary

### E.1 Introduction

E.1.1 South East Scotland Transport Partnership (SEStran), Fife Council and Clackmannanshire Council appointed Scott Wilson to carry out a STAG – based study to examine freight and passenger transport connectivity issues between Clackmannanshire, Fife and Edinburgh. This followed the Regional Transport Strategy, produced by SEStran, which had identified several projects for taking forward to improve transport connectivity in the area. As a result, this study considered a wide range of possibilities for transport enhancement, for both public transport and freight.

### E.2 Issues, Opportunities and Consultation

E.2.1 An analysis of the key transport and travel patterns on the strategic network was undertaken. This reviewed the main issues involving both passenger and freight transport in the area, and also considered future development plans that could impact on transport. Other issues such as modal split and severance were also examined and conclusions drawn which distilled the problems, constraints and opportunities in the corridor.

E.2.2 An extensive consultation exercise was carried out, including a workshop with key stakeholders, freight operators and local businesses. The comments and views obtained from the consultation were used to identify the issues/opportunities in the corridor, from which a number of Transport Planning Objectives (TPOs) for the study were developed.

### E.3 Option Development and Appraisal

E.3.1 The next stage was to identify options that were likely to meet the TPOs and national transport objectives of the study. The analysis of the problems and opportunities, together with a preliminary assessment of travel patterns and demand in the corridor and also the results of the consultation undertaken, identified a total of 12 outline options and sub-options which were considered. These covered rail, express bus, waterborne and road options, with some of them having complementary freight facilities included.

E.3.2 The assessment was carried out in accordance with the Scottish Transport Appraisal Guidance (STAG). This included an initial evaluation of the 12 outline options, which sifted them down to a shortlist of proposals that were taken forward into a more detailed STAG appraisal. From the initial STAG, a short list of four options were identified as being worthy of further consideration. These were:

- Option A – use of the existing railway line from Alloa to Rosyth with both passenger and freight services, including stops at Clackmannan, Kincardine and Cairneyhill and with the Charlestown Chord in place. Services could be run on an hourly basis as an extension of the Glasgow-Stirling-Alloa service to Edinburgh, and vice versa;
- Option B – as option A but without the Charlestown Chord in place, requiring a switch-back operation and an additional rail service time of 15 minutes;
- Option C – this consisted of the rail freight option conforming to the rail alignment in option A, plus a new express bus service with an alignment

following the A985, stopping at Clackmannan, Kincardine, Cairneyhill and onto Edinburgh; and

- Option D – as for Option C, but with a new express bus service with an alignment following the A907 with stops at Clackmannan, Oakley and onto Edinburgh.

E.3.3 The layout of these options is shown overleaf.

## E.4 Summary of the Detailed STAG Assessment

E.4.1 The Table below presents the results of the detailed STAG appraisal.

Criteria	Option			
	A	B	C	D
Objective 1 – Connectivity	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓
Objective 2 – Freight Accessibility	✓✓	✓	0/✓	0/✓
Objective 3 – Accident Savings	✓✓	✓✓	✓	✓
Objective 4 – Local Environmental Impacts	✓	✓	0/✓	0/✓
Environment – Air Quality & noise	✓	✓	✓	✓
Environment – Other	××	××	××	××
Safety	✓	✓	✓	✓
Economy	✓✓	✓	0	×
Integration	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
Accessibility/Social Inclusion	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
Technical Issues	✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
Operational Aspects	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓✓
Public Acceptability	✓✓✓	✓✓✓	✓✓	✓✓
Cost to Government	××	××	×	×

E.4.2 The results suggested that option A performed the best, followed by option B.

## E.5 Recommendations

E.5.1 The chief recommendation would be to select option A as the preferred solution. However, there are concerns with issues regarding train path availability. If this option is taken forward, then we recommend an operational assessment be carried out to find a potential solution as this may have an impact on journey times. Patronage forecasts would need to be considered again in light of any emerging operating plan. In addition, we have identified opportunities to reduce the cost assumptions supplied during the course of this study. This could improve the economic performance of option A.

E.5.2 However, it should be recognised that this project has not been properly considered within the Scottish Government's Strategic Project Review (STPR). It would therefore be prudent for SEStran, together with Fife and Clackmannanshire Council's, to engage in serious discussion with Transport Scotland on how this project may sit relative to current STPR projects and what proposals there may be to review the STPR in the future.

